

Name of Applicant	Proposal	Expiry Date	Plan Ref.
Mr Michael Banks	Side extension at first floor level plus single storey rear extension 46 Rea Avenue, Rubery, Birmingham, Worcestershire, B45 9SS	07.07.2020	20/00442/FUL

RECOMMENDATION: That planning permission be **REFUSED**

Councillor McDonald has requested that this application be considered by the Planning Committee rather than being determined under delegated powers

Publicity

Four neighbours consulted 30.04.2020 Expired 25.05.2020

Neighbour Responses

8 representations received in support of the application, raising comments as summarised below:

- This style is in keeping with the properties in the local area and particularly on this street.
- There are at least 4 other properties of the same style within close proximity to number 46 that have been extended in the same way.

Cllr Peter McDonald

I am requesting the above application should be Called-In. The reason is the objection to it is causing concern in the local area as there seems to be a change of direction in the officer's advice on this application. Applications such as these on the estate would normally be accepted, therefore, it should be a matter for the Planning Committee to discuss and determine the application.

Relevant Policies

Bromsgrove District Plan

BDP1 Sustainable Development Principles
BDP19 High Quality Design

Others

NPPF National Planning Policy Framework (2019)
Bromsgrove High Quality Design SPD

Relevant Planning History

None

Assessment of Proposal

The site and its surroundings

The property lies within an established residential area of Rubery and is a 'Mucklow' style house which are well known in this area. The semi-detached property is attached to number 44 Rea Avenue.

The proposed development

Planning permission is sought to create a side extension at first floor measuring approximately 3.6 metres in width. A single storey rear extension measuring approximately 3.1 metres from the existing rear wall, with a maximum height of 3.4 metres is also proposed.

The first floor extension would form a larger bedroom and bathroom and the single storey ground floor extension would create an enlarged kitchen/dining area/living area.

The walls would be constructed in brick to match the existing dwelling. The roof to both the two storey and single storey extensions would be tiled to match the existing.

Assessment

The recommendation is to refuse the application based on the proposed first floor side extension. No objections are raised to the single storey rear extension.

Streetscene considerations

One of the concerns in this case is the enclosing of the space between the site address and the neighbouring property where an extension already exists.

Policy BDP19 of the Bromsgrove District Plan requires developments to enhance the character and distinctiveness of the local area. In general, this part of Rea Avenue is made up of two distinctive house types arranged in small groups and along a generally consistent building line, with clear and open views along the road. A result of this arrangement is a very a regular pattern of buildings with spaces between them.

These spaces are formed at first floor either as a result of the single storey garages which generally exist within the street or because of the design of the Mucklow houses and their cat slide roofs to the side. A distinctive character is created as a result of these elements and their arrangement, one which requires positive treatment during the consideration of a planning proposal under Policy BDP19.

When considering the proposal against that character, it is clear that the majority of the space between number 46 and number 48 would be eroded, leaving a very limited gap at first floor level of around just 1m between the dwellings. It is considered that such a loss of space would undermine the characteristic features of Rea Avenue and that as a result the proposal would be harmful to the wider street scene. As such, it is considered that the proposed first floor side extension would not be policy compliant.

Character and appearance of existing dwelling

The design of the first floor side extension is considered to be in conflict with Policy BDP19 'High Quality Design' of the adopted Bromsgrove District Plan. The Councils Supplementary Planning Document (SPD) at Section 3.3 states:

"Side extensions will be required to be subordinate in size and prominence. To achieve this, extensions should be clearly set down from the ridge of the dwelling and set back from the principal elevation;

Extensions should reflect the proportions of the original building. To achieve this, an extension should be of a smaller and less substantial scale than the main building as over-large extensions can unbalance the proportion and harmony of the host building and can also have a detrimental effect on the street scene as a whole".

It should be noted that there are examples of properties which have been extended in a similar to manner to that proposed here through historic permissions. A more recent extension to 24 Leasow Road has been brought to the Councils attention. That extension is however not within the same street and street scene harm is not considered to occur in that particular case.

Application 19/00954/FUL at 60 Leasow Rd has been brought to the applicant's attention where an approved extension has very recently been implemented. An image is available for members to view within the officers presentation. Further, it has been brought to the applicant's attention that an extension has very recently been granted at No 28 Rea Avenue under reference 19/01541/FUL (which is yet to be implemented) and has been designed in accordance with the above SPD and is therefore policy compliant. The approved plans for application 19/01541/FUL are also set out within the presentation documents. It should be noted that No. 28 is only a few doors down from the application property (No.46) and situated on the same side of the road.

Clearly each application has to be assessed on its individual merits. In this case the proposal does not represent a policy compliant form of development and is therefore recommended for refusal. The approval of this application would inevitably mean that future planning applications for first floor side extensions to Mucklow style houses (of which there are many in this area) would be more difficult to resist and would therefore result in more developments being approved where they are not in accordance with the Policies set out within the Councils development plan, contrary to Section 38(6) of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and Section 70(2) of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

The planning department have engaged with the applicant in order to seek amendments to this scheme. Similar discussions took place with the applicant residing at No. 28 Rea Avenue, where, in that case, plans were amended and a policy compliant form of development was achieved. The applicant has chosen not to amend the scheme in this case, considering that the application should be determined as submitted.

Residential amenity

There are considered to be no harmful impacts to residential amenity in this case and it is noted that no objections from the wider public have been received in this respect.

RECOMMENDATION: That planning permission be **REFUSED**

Reasons for Refusal

1. The proposed first floor side extension by reason of its scale and design would represent an overly large and dominating addition to the dwelling harming the character of the original dwelling. The proposal would be contrary to Policy BDP19 of the Bromsgrove District Plan and the Councils Supplementary Planning Document (High Quality Design)
2. The proposed first floor side extension would result in a narrowing of an existing first floor gap between dwellings where such gaps are commonplace within Rea Avenue. The proposed development would harm the visual amenities of the area and would fail to comply with to comply with Policy BDP19 of the Bromsgrove District Plan and the Councils Supplementary Planning Document (High Quality Design)

Case Officer: Sue Lattimer Tel: 01527 881336
Email: s.lattimer@bromsgroveandredditch.gov.uk